

République tunisienne
Ministère de l'enseignement supérieur et de la recherche scientifique
Université de Sfax
Faculté des Lettres et des Sciences Humaines



RU RECHERCHES
UNIVERSITAIRES
FLSHS

ISSN 2811-6585

Academic Research

مجلة بحوث جامعية

Revue d'études littéraires, linguistiques et de sciences humaines

Numéro 18

(2024)

<https://recherches-universitaires-flshs.com/>

Ce site permettra aux internautes qui s'y inscriront via l'«Espace Membre» de consulter ou de télécharger des articles déjà parus dans les numéros précédents de la revue ou alors de soumettre des articles pour évaluation à paraître après acceptation dans un prochain numéro.

Recherches Universitaires
Academic Research

مجلة باحث جامعية

ISSN – 2811-6585

Numéro 18 (2024)

Rédacteur-en-chef

Sadok Damak

Comité de rédaction

Salem Ayadi

Henda Ammar-Guirat

Ali Ben Nasr

Najiba Chkir

Hammadi Dhouib

Néji El-Ounelli

Habib Jamoussi

Mohamed Jerbi

Moncef Mahwachi

Riadh Miladi

Fathi Rekik

Akila Sellami-Baklouti

Kamel Skander

Mustapha Trabelsi

La revue pratique la double lecture à l'aveugle : chaque proposition d'article est anonymisée puis est lue par deux experts choisis par le Comité de rédaction pour l'évaluer.

Le double anonymat est strictement respecté, c'est une condition de la rigueur de l'évaluation. Le Comité de rédaction prend sa décision de publication (ou de rejet) sur la base des deux rapports d'expertise. Dans le cas où il faut arbitrer entre évaluations divergentes, il est fait appel à un troisième expert et il est demandé à l'un des membres du Comité de rédaction d'expertiser à son tour l'article dont l'évaluation n'a pas été unanime.

Les opinions qui y sont exprimées n'impliquent que les auteurs des articles qui y sont publiés et ne reflètent ni les opinions de l'éditeur ni celles du Comité de rédaction. Les auteurs sont seuls responsables des idées soutenues dans leurs articles respectifs.

Faculté des Lettres & des Sciences Humaines

B.P. 1168 Sfax 3000, Tunisie

Phone – 00.216.74.670.557

Fax – 00.216.74.670.540

Website – www.flshs.rnu.tn

Sommaire : Tome I

Comité de rédaction – ii

Remerciements – iv

1

Les récits d'un holocauste commun dans *Étoile errante* de Le Clézio – Page 1

Moez Rebai

2

« L'autre Tunisien », chez les voyageurs européens du XVIII^e siècle – Page 25

Habib Jamoussi

3

Global Citizenship across the Tunisian Curriculum: EFL, Civic Education, and History Textbooks as a Case Study – Page 57

Nadia Abid

Tome II – (Recueil d'articles en arabe) 87

<https://recherches-universitaires-flshs.com>

Ce site permettra aux internautes qui s'y inscriront via l'«Espace Membre» de consulter ou de télécharger des articles déjà parus dans les numéros précédents de la revue ou alors de soumettre des articles pour évaluation à paraître après acceptation dans un prochain numéro.

Remerciements

Les membres du comité de rédaction de la revue tiennent à remercier les évaluateurs académiques dont les noms suivent qui ont contribué par leurs compétences et leur expertise à l'aboutissement de ce numéro.

Votre professionnalisme a été un élément essentiel à la réussite de cette publication.

- Mohamed Ben Ayed
- Mohamed Bouhlel
- Radhouan Briki
- Mohamed Jerbi
- Bassem Jmal
- Mohamed Kallel
- Fathi Lissir
- Ali Loumi
- Asma Moalla
- Fathi Rekik
- Chokri Smaoui
- Mustapha Trabelsi

<https://recherches-universitaires-flshs.com>

Ce site permettra aux internautes qui s'y inscrivent via l'«Espace Membre» de consulter ou de télécharger des articles déjà parus dans les numéros précédents de la revue ou alors de soumettre des articles pour évaluation à paraître après acceptation dans un prochain numéro.

Global Citizenship across the Tunisian Curriculum: EFL, Civic Education, and History Textbooks as a Case Study

Nadia Abid*

Abstract

The present study examines the extent to which three Tunisian secondary school textbooks used in history, civic education, and English classes promote the development of Global Citizenship education. Particularly, it aims to compare the results to identify ways of implementing Global Citizenship Education as a cross-curricular approach. To this end, content analysis was used for the evaluation of textbooks' topics and activities based on UNESCO's guidelines of global citizenship topics and skills, attitudes, and knowledge. The results showed differences among textbooks in addressing GCE topics and skills due to the specificity of each subject. The study suggested that despite the difference, it is possible to adopt GCE as a cross-curricular approach through collaboration among the subjects. Ideas were suggested on how to implement CCE as an approach across the selected subjects.

Keywords: *Global Citizenship, textbook, cross-curricular approach, global, local, curriculum*

Introduction

Approaches to citizenship education aim to foster allegiance to the nation through a curriculum focusing on the nation's history and societal values (Tudball and Henderson, 2014). This concept of nation-bound citizenship is, however, never static but changes in accordance with the economic, social, and political changes in the world. To cope with those changes and respond to the needs of the global market, education policies in different countries have made reforms to adopt a global perspective on education (Engel et al., 2014; Cates, 2022). The concept of global citizenship education (GCE) has therefore emerged to account for the interconnectedness of people and the interrelatedness of global and local concerns. A new model was also created of citizens who are “capable of participating in their own communities, the nation, and the wider world” (Tudball & Henderson, 2014, p. 10).

* Faculty of Arts & Humanities, University of Sfax – Tunisia.
DOI : [10.71549/ru.i18.246](https://doi.org/10.71549/ru.i18.246)

Global citizenship education has been established and adopted as a pedagogical approach by educators in Europe, North America, and the UK (Cates, 2022) and has been advocated by UNESCO's 2012 Global Education First Initiative to foster learners' sense of belonging to a larger community and awareness of the interdependence between local and global concerns. UNESCO's documents (2015, 2018) have provided a comprehensive account of GCE's learning outcomes, topics, methods, and materials. According to UNESCO (2015), GCE targets the development of three learning domains, namely the cognitive, socio-emotional, and behavioral domains, which can serve as the basis for defining learning objectives, competences, and priorities for assessment. Global citizenship can be taught as a stand-alone subject within the curriculum, as an integrated component in specific school subjects such as history and geography, as a school-wide issue including curricular and extra-curricular activities, and as a cross-curricular issue. In terms of methodology, GCE uses "formal and informal approaches, curricular and extracurricular interventions, and conventional and unconventional pathways to participation" (UNESCO, 2015, p. 15). In terms of materials, textbooks play an important role in the implementation of the global education approach through teaching the values and principles of citizenship and setting models for active participation.

Research on GCE in textbooks has mainly focused on the extent to which global citizenship values and skills were represented in textbooks' contents and activities. These studies were conducted on textbooks teaching social sciences subjects (Idrissi, 2020; Idrissi & Benabderrazik, 2020) and the English language (Ait-Bouزيد, 2020; Sahli & Belaid, 2022). Most of these studies examined global citizenship as a cross-curricular approach to teaching individual subjects and explained the benefits of such an approach and the methods of its implementation. Given the lack of research on the inclusion of GCE across the different subjects in the curriculum, and motivated by the author's belief in the importance of GCE for the education of Tunisian youth to act as responsible citizens in a newly emerging democracy and in the world, this study argues for the adoption of GCE as one of the main objectives of the Tunisian curriculum that should be achieved across all subjects.

Unlike the studies reviewed in the literature, the present research evaluates three locally-produced Tunisian textbooks used to teach history, civic education, and English as a foreign language (EFL) to determine how they have incorporated and taught global citizenship values and skills. The resulting data will help suggest ways in which the subjects in question can draw on one another's topics and skills to enrich and improve their teaching of global citizenship. Drawing on the topics and activities of other subjects helps the adoption and implementation of GCE as an approach to the teaching of different subjects across the curriculum. The study, therefore, aims to answer the following research questions:

- (1) How are global citizenship topics and skills represented in the history, civic education, and English language textbooks used by Tunisian students of the second form of secondary education?
- (2) How can the topics and methods identified be used to teach global citizenship across the three subjects?

1. Literature Review

1.1. Global Citizenship education across the curriculum

Advocates of a cross-curricular approach to GCE emphasize the fact that it should not be taught independently of other subjects in the curriculum. It should, however, be adopted as an approach that is valid across the curriculum and included in subjects such as foreign languages, social studies, music, mathematics, and natural sciences (Cates, 2022; Pike and Selby, 1988). Cates (2022), for instance, argues that borrowing ideas, content, methods, and materials from other subjects is a common practice among teachers. Cates (2022) proposes different ways in which the global dimension can be incorporated into language teaching, covering course design, content, methods, materials, extra-curricular activities, and overseas initiatives. Drawing on social studies and sciences, Cates (2022) suggests that course design should be based on three main themes, namely geographic literacy, and world themes which are basically cultural, and global issues (economy, poverty, natural disaster, education, environment, immigration, etc.). Teaching techniques are inspired by different teaching methods and approaches such as communicative language teaching,

cooperative learning, inquiry-based learning, and content-based instruction. The teaching techniques include debates, discussions, simulations, role plays, surveys, interviews, project work, case studies, etc.

Research on GCE as a cross-curricular issue has tackled the relationship between GCE education and different school subjects including social sciences and scientific ones. The history class, for instance, can develop critical thinking and a sense of belonging to one's country and the world by promoting an understanding of national and international historical events and relating the past to the present and future (Brett, 2005; Santisteban et al., 2018). In geography class, Esteves (2012) suggests that the global citizenship approach enables learners to understand environmental issues and their impact on their lives. It also enables them to improve their communication and critical thinking skills while exploring geographical topics at local and international levels (Esteves, 2012). Learners learn to appreciate and accept diversity through exposure to themes such as immigration and its effects on shaping the ethnic composition of the receiving societies (Esteves, 2012).

Although citizenship education is traditionally associated with social studies subjects, mathematics education has also been approached from a global citizenship perspective. Both mathematics and citizenship education target the development and use of skills such as critical thinking, problem-solving, and reasoning to ensure society's sustainable development (Geiger et al., 2023). According to Oxfam's guidelines (2015), the GCE approach to mathematics education offers learners meaningful opportunities to link local and global perspectives through the use and manipulation of mathematical data to solve real-life problems. Similar to history and geography, the foreign language class has a global relevance (Risager, 2020) as it allows learners to discover other perspectives and worldviews (Risager, 2020; Wagner & Byram, 2017). It is a space of encounter and interaction between the self, the other, and the world, and a place where intercultural learning develops.

1.2. The Tunisian Context

According to the Education Act (2002-2007), citizenship is basically national but includes a universal dimension, drawing on

universal principles of freedom, democracy, social justice, and human rights. Citizenship is integrated into social studies courses such as history, geography, and civic education. For instance, both the national and global citizenship values and skills are emphasized in the history program for secondary school level through raising learners' awareness of the national identity while promoting knowledge of the great historical changes and their contribution to human civilization. Global values and attitudes are promoted in relation to the human values of open-mindedness towards civilizations and comparison between the national identity markers and other cultures.

Unlike history, citizenship in civic education is related to human rights, democracy, and freedom which are citizenship values acknowledged by national and international legislations (Civic Education Programs for Secondary Education, 2008). The local and the global in the syllabus interact and relate through studying the relationship between the country's institutions and international organizations and developing the skill of using local and international resources to promote critical thinking and positive attitudes (Civic Education Programs for Secondary Education, 2008). In the English as a Foreign Language syllabus, (English Programs for Secondary Education. Years, 1, 2, 3, 4, 2008), citizenship does not figure as a topic or a skill. The programs define language as a system and a means of communication and self-expression, ignoring the educational dimension of the subject. The global dimension is only apparent in the use of English as a means to access universal culture through Anglophone contexts, limiting universal culture to the Anglophone context.

To conclude, it is noted that citizenship whether national or global is not a cross-curricular issue. Civic education and history seem to be more concerned with global skills and values than EFL. For this reason, a scrutiny of their contents and activities and a comparison between them can lead to deeper insights into how to make global citizenship a cross-curricular competence.

1.3. Research on Global Citizenship Education in Textbooks

Research on the development of global citizenship in textbooks has mainly focused on the evaluation of their contents and activities in terms of their promotion of global citizenship values,

knowledge, skills, and attitudes. In the European context, for instance, Engel (2014) investigated Spain's recent Education for Citizenship and Human Rights Curriculum and three associated textbooks in terms of three components, namely human rights, national and global citizenship, and cultural diversity and co-existence. She pointed out that the curriculum and the textbooks gave a reductionist perspective on citizenship that undermined critical questions related to national, European, and global citizenship, global interconnectivity, and immigration.

In non-European contexts, particularly in the Maghreb countries, citizenship education has gained much importance, especially after the Arab Spring revolutions (Idrissi, 2020). Idrissi (2020) and Idrissi and Benabderrazik (2020) investigated citizenship education in primary school social studies curricula and textbooks in Morocco in terms of their teaching of national and global citizenship values and skills. Researchers argued that learners' opportunities to connect to the global community could be limited by the textbooks' focus on national issues.

In the context of English as a foreign language, studies on EFL textbooks' promotion of global citizenship pointed out the absence of some topics related to human rights, conflict resolution (Ait-Bouid, 2020), gender equality, violence against women and women abuse (Sahli & Belaid, 2022). The incorporation of these topics was considered necessary due to their special relevance to the local context (Sahli & Belaid, 2022).

In the Tunisian context, Abid (2021) investigated teaching global issues for intercultural citizenship in a secondary school Tunisian EFL textbook. The study showed the textbook's low potential for the development of intercultural citizenship due to the structural and essentialist orientations of its activities and content, respectively. The study recommended that GCE should be taught across the curriculum and that the collaboration between English language teachers and teachers of other subjects can be beneficial for improving the quality of English language teaching.

The studies reviewed dealt with the issue of global citizenship in textbooks of individual subjects as an example of a cross-curricular approach to GCE. This study aims to analyze and compare three textbooks of three different subjects to discuss the

possibility of collaboration between the subjects to consequently develop GCE across the curriculum.

2. Methodology

This section provides a description of the corpus selected for analysis, the analytical framework adopted for the analysis and interpretation of data, and the procedures followed for data collection and analysis.

2.1. Corpus

Three locally produced textbooks designed for teaching history, English, and civic education in the second form of secondary education were selected for analysis. The three textbooks were authorized by the Tunisian Ministry of Education and published by the National Pedagogic Centre to be used by students across Tunisia. The English and history textbooks were written by inspectors and senior teachers of the subjects. The civic education textbook was, however, written by teachers holding university degrees in law, philosophy, and sociology, which might explain the mutliperspectival approach to the representation of citizenship topics in the civic education textbook. The history textbook aims to promote students' knowledge of historical events and their contribution to human civilization. Civic education textbook, however, focuses on issues related to human rights, democracy, and freedom and how these issues are dealt with by national and international legal bodies.

The history and civic education textbooks were selected for analysis because, with reference to the prefaces of their official programs, global citizenship values, principles, and skills figure among the objectives of teaching these subjects. The geography textbook could have been included within the scope of this study because global citizenship is also mentioned as one of the outcomes of teaching geography to Tunisian students. Due to the similarity of some topics in civic education and history and the need to limit the scope of the study, the geography textbook was not used. The English language textbook was selected given the status of English as a global language and the role it plays in introducing global education and developing global citizenship in class. This role is widely acknowledged by the literature on GCE.

2.2. Analytical Framework

The study used quantitative and qualitative content analysis of the three selected textbooks in terms of the global topics they address and the global skills they aim to develop. The analysis was conducted based on the thematic paper “Global Citizenship Education: Topics and Learning Objectives” issued by UNESCO (2015) which provides a detailed account and classification of global citizenship topics and skills relevant to each learning domain (see tables 1 and 2). According to the document, each learning domain, be it cognitive, socio-emotional, or behavioral, includes the development of global citizenship skills. As Table (1) shows, the textbooks should enable students to know local, national, and global issues, understand their interconnectedness, and use critical thinking skills. As for the socio-emotional skills, they include the learners’ acquisition of a sense of belonging to the international community as well as attitudes of empathy, solidarity, and respect for cultural differences. The behavioral skills include learners’ willingness and ability to act effectively at local, national, and international levels. As far as global topics are concerned, the same document provides a list of topics that curricula and textbooks can adopt to promote global citizenship education. Table (2) outlines the major categories of global topics that tackled national and global issues, the relationship between them, power relationships, intercultural communication issues, identity and respect for otherness, ethical responsibility, engagement, and taking action.

Table 1: UNESCO’s Global Citizenship Skills

Cognitive skills	Socio-emotional skills	Behavioral skills
Learners acquire knowledge and understanding of local, national, and global issues and the interconnectedness of different countries.	Learners experience a sense of belonging to a common humanity, sharing values and responsibilities, based on human rights.	Learners act effectively and responsibly at local, national, and global levels for a more peaceful and sustainable world.

Learners develop skills for critical thinking and analysis.	Learners develop attitudes of empathy, solidarity, and respect for differences and diversity.	Learners develop motivation and willingness to take necessary actions.
---	---	--

(UNESCO, 2015, p. 22)

Table 2: UNESCO's Global Topics

Topics
Global and local issues and the relationships between them
Local, national, and global governance systems and structures
Issues affecting interaction and connectedness
Underlying assumptions and power dynamics
Cultivating and managing identities, relationships, and respect for diversity
Engagement, action, and ethical responsibility

2.3. Procedures

The analysis of the corpus aimed to identify the extent to which global topics and skills were represented by the three textbooks and relate between them to understand how global citizenship education is addressed in the textbooks' content and activities. The findings were aimed to lead to suggestions on how each subject could benefit from the way GCE was promoted in the other subject to improve its teaching and make GCE a cross-curricular skill. To do this, the textbooks' topics were identified, counted, and distributed according to UNESCO's (2015) classification of global topics. As far as the skills are concerned, all kinds of skills were identified and, then, classified according to whether they promote global skills or general order skills.

The next stage consisted of determining the frequency distribution of global skills over the three learning domains in each textbook. This helped determine whether the textbooks analyzed encouraged taking action or were limited to the transmission of knowledge of global issues. This stage was followed by a more focused analysis of global skills in each domain separately. The presentation of data included the frequency distribution of the global skills in each textbook as well as examples of verbs used to give instructions or of types of activities.

3. Results

This section gives a detailed account of the results obtained from the analysis of the three selected textbooks' topics and activities.

3.1. Topics

As shown in Table (3), the analysis reveals a discrepancy across school subjects in terms of focus and variety of the different topics tackled. The textbooks present different topics with various interests depending on the specificity of the school subjects. For instance, the TEFL textbook includes everyday life topics and global economic and environmental issues such as inflation, income, pollution, water scarcity, rainforests, and consumerism. They also encompass issues concerned with human rights, namely gender equality, child labor, slavery, and freedom. As far as communication is concerned, there is concern with the danger of

internet addiction, undermining the issue of intercultural communication and misunderstanding. Topics dealing with identity and the relationship with the other and respect for diversity are very limited. Topics dealing with engagement and social responsibility are presented in texts about orphan children and child labor.

The history textbook focuses more on macro-level issues such as democracy, political systems, slavery, social justice, and the development of human thought. Issues related to communication and relationships are absent; whereas those related to interculturality and the relationship among nations are represented. Those varied topics are tackled from a historical perspective highlighting their development across human history and their relationship to the present. Similarly, issues such as slavery and social justice are dealt with from a historical perspective with a focus on both slavery and human rights in the world and in Tunisia. The global dimension is not only apparent in wars and colonization that involved different countries, but it is also apparent in the study of how human thought in different societies and eras evolved and contributed to the development of human civilization in domains such as geography, medicine, and other sciences. As far as identities and diversity, the history textbook presents topics about ethnic diversity and interculturality, relating the local context to the global one. Issues about engagement and social responsibility are absent due to the nature of the subject.

Civic education textbook includes topics on democratic and political institutions and processes, power and power relations, and human rights including oppression, freedom, equality, and freedom of speech. Topics also deal with civil society, the different civil society organizations, and their roles in society. Issues on identities and respect for diversity are not included; whereas, national and international organizations are mentioned emphasizing the interconnectedness between local and global dimensions of those issues.

To sum up, the analysis of topics in the three textbooks revealed two major conclusions. The first is the variability of topics across disciplines. The presence or/and absence of some issues is determined by the objectives of the subject. The second conclusion is that the topics tackled, except for those in the TEFL textbook,

emphasized the interconnectedness between the local and global through the presence of content from local and global societies and cultures.

Table 3: Global topics in the selected textbooks

Topics	EFL	History	Civic education
Global and local issues and the relationships between them	Economic issues: inflation, incomes, economic changes	Democracy, political systems, and institutions	Power and power relations
Local, national, and global governance systems and structures	Environmental issues: pollution, water scarcity, ozone layer, rainforests	Citizen's rights, law, Wars and colonization,	Democracy and democratic processes
Issues affecting interaction and connectedness	Human rights: gender equality, child labor, slavery, freedom	Ethnic groups, ethnic diversity, slavery, social justice	Human rights (oppression, gender equality, freedom, freedom of speech
Underlying assumptions and power dynamics	Online communication: internet addiction Violence, nutrition	The contribution of human thought in different societies and eras to the development of human civilization	Civil society and civil society organizations

Cultivating and managing identities, relationships, and respect for diversity	Family/importance of family	Ethnic groups, ethnic diversity/ Interculturality	Nothing
Engagement, action, and ethical responsibility	Orphan children/ Child labor	Nothing	Civil society and civil society organizations: NGOs, political parties, trade unions, consumer defense) National Organizations: neighborhoods committees, the organization of education and family

3.2. Activities

The frequency distribution of global and general-focus activities in the selected textbooks reveals that global activities are significantly less frequent than general-focus activities in the EFL and history textbooks. In the civic education textbook, however, the two types are evenly distributed. It is also observed that the civic education textbook has more globally oriented activities than other textbooks. As for the English textbook, nearly a third of the activities address global skills; whereas 65.97% of the activities aim to teach comprehension and language.

Table 4: The distribution of textbooks' activities over types of activities

	Global activities	General focus activities
EFL	34.02%	65.97%
History	16.18%	87.96%
Civic education	55.14%	53.73%

The following table (Table 5) shows the frequency distribution of global skills identified in the three textbooks over the three learning domains.

Table 5: The frequency distribution of global skills over the textbooks

Domain	TEFL	History	Civic education
Cognitive	53 (80.30%)	39 (84.78%)	92 (83.63%)
Socio-emotional	7 (10.60%)	7 (15.21%)	8 (7.27%)
Behavioral	6 (9.09%)	0 (0%)	10 (9.09%)
Total	66 (29.72%)	46 (20.22%)	110 (49.54%)

Table (5) demonstrates an uneven distribution of the skills over the different domains and in each textbook. There is a clear overrepresentation of cognitive skills compared with the socio-emotional and behavioral ones, which implies that the textbooks focus more on the transmission of knowledge than on developing a sense of belonging, empathy, and solidarity. There is less concern

with encouraging learners to act responsibly for the benefit of the local and international communities. In other words, the skill component is knowledge-oriented rather than action-oriented. It may not help learners go beyond simple knowledge of topics and facts to take action.

3.2.1. The Cognitive Domain

The analysis of the cognitive domain shows that the activities inviting understanding are more frequent than those promoting critical thinking and analysis skills. What is noted from Table (6) is that activities requiring analysis, reflection, and criticism are less frequent than those requiring a simple understanding of local and global issues.

Table 6: Distribution of activities over cognitive skills across the textbooks

Cognitive skill	TEFL	History	Civic education
Learners acquire knowledge and understanding of local, national, and global issues, interconnectedness of different countries	39 (read, listen, and answer the questions, gap filling, Information transfer, multiple choice)	26 (mention, study, classify, know, explain, understand, identify, show (from texts))	67 (discover, identify, give examples, understand, determine from texts)
Learners develop skills for critical thinking and analysis.	14 (discuss, express opinion, find solution, solve, decide, what can you do)	13 (compare, relate, study and explain)	25 (discuss, compare, imagine, express opinion, relate, solve,
Total	53	39	92

The activities promoting knowledge in the TEFL textbook are mostly reading and listening comprehension activities where learners are required to gain understanding and knowledge through answering questions, gap-filling, information transfer, and multiple choice questions. As for the activities teaching critical thinking and analysis skills, they are mostly based on discussions or individual activities where they express opinions or solve a problem. In addition, most activities are locally oriented asking learners to discuss and solve, in pairs or groups, a particular issue in their environment. Few are the activities that relate the discussion of global issues to the local ones. An example of activities that relate to the local and global is a speaking activity that follows reading a text about water scarcity in the world. The pairs would discuss the topic in their own country guided by the following questions: “Is water scarcity a problem in Tunisia? Are there practical efforts to reduce the effects of water scarcity? What can you do as individuals?”

As for the history textbook, the activities addressing factual knowledge are found to outnumber those inviting critical thinking. Activities transmit knowledge through reading different types of texts followed by instructions to identify details, determine causes and effects, and complete a table or map from texts. That kind of information transfer activity requires a mere reproduction of the information in different formats rather than a deeper understanding of the text. It should be noted that those knowledge-oriented activities are performed by individual learners and involve neither negotiation of meaning nor collaboration. An example of this type of activities is reading a text about Arab scientists and their contribution to human thought. The instruction is as follows: “Determine the contribution of Arabs and Muslims to the development of human civilization in terms of sciences, arts, medicine, geography, etc.”

Activities inviting critical thinking include instructions asking students to compare and relate events in different historical periods. An example of this is “Examine Al-Idrissi’s map. How is it different from today’s world map?” In this activity, students examine the world map as designed by the Arab geographer Al-Idrissi to create the most accurate map of the world in pre-modern times. The activity requires learners to look for a map of today’s

world, compare it with Al-Idrissi's, and identify similarities and differences, highlighting the interesting work that Al-Idrissi made to make such an important contribution to human knowledge.

The same results are found in the civic education textbook concerning the overrepresentation of knowledge skills and the underrepresentation of critical analysis skills. A good example of activities included in the civic education textbook is "case studies" where students work in groups to solve a problem and make decisions. The following is an example of the case studies:

"Respond to a letter you received from a friend from another country whose brother was imprisoned and tortured because of his opinions and defense of human rights. Advise him on what to do to help him find a solution by referring to the following documents (going to local courts, complaining to the International Amnesty Organization.)"

This is an example of an activity that combines the local and global by referring to local and international legal institutions that can solve the problem of a person. At the affective level, students' sense of belonging to the world is reinforced by feelings of protection from international legal bodies. In terms of skills, students would make informed decisions by examining different resources to solve a problem.

3.2.2. The Socio-Emotional Domain

When examining the skills addressing the socio-emotional domain, the findings in Table (5) reveal an insignificant presence of these skills in the three textbooks. The results showed that the sense of belonging to a common humanity with shared values and responsibilities is more developed in the history textbook than in other textbooks. As Table (7) shows, the history textbook includes topics dealing with the history of Tunisia with a focus on the contribution of the Arab and Islamic people to the development of human civilization.

Developing attitudes of empathy, solidarity, and respect are more frequent in TEFL and civic education textbooks. In the TEFL textbook, for instance, an activity requires students to express concern about children's appalling conditions without suggesting any solutions. The activity is described as follows:

“the situation of children is rather difficult if not alarming in many countries – poverty, illiteracy, hunger, diseases, and exploitation are some of the problems they face. You decide to write an article for a daily newspaper to express your worries and concerns about the situation and to remind people of children’s basic rights as human beings.”

Another example taken from the civic education textbook illustrates an intercultural issue that can teach tolerance of and respect for difference. The activity invites learners to reflect on a situation of a mixed marriage within the family, think of how to react and behave with culturally different people and respect personal freedom (choice of a partner). The activity’s instructions are described as follows:

“your sister is going to marry someone from another country and culture and live with you. How would you behave with them?”

Table 7: The distribution of textbooks’ activities in the socio-emotional domain

Socio-emotional domain	EFL	History	Civic education
Learners experience a sense of belonging to a common humanity, sharing values and responsibilities, based on human rights.	Discuss and express your attitude towards the negative effects of violence/ the importance of apologizing.	Study the characteristics of Berbers; the native people of the Maghreb. Understand the conditions of Arabization and Islamization	Discuss how these principles and values have roots in our Arab Islamic cultural heritage Case study to solve a legal problem (local/international)

		know, discover	
Learners develop attitudes of empathy, solidarity, and respect for differences and diversity.	Express worries and concerns about the situation of many children across the world (diseases, poverty, hunger, illiteracy	Nothing	<p>Explain how respect for human rights fosters democracy/ the meaning of tolerance and its importance/ the view of Islam towards extremism.</p> <p>Give examples illustrating the concept of tolerance in Islam.</p> <p>Determine reasons for the importance of dialogue.</p>

3.2.3. The Behavioral Domain

The behavioral domain is the least addressed domain as shown in Table (8). The willingness to participate and take action at the national and global levels is found in the civic education and TEFL textbooks, whereas it is totally absent in the history textbook. One of the issues that are fundamental to students is that of the environment and more precisely that of the school environment. The following is an example of an activity from the civic education textbook that states: “You are worried about your school environment. You decided to cooperate with classmates to find a

solution. Make plans and make decisions about how to act and sensitize people about the importance of cleaning the environment.”

The activity’s instructions invite learners and incite them to perform global skills such as cooperation, problem-solving, planning actions, and taking decisions. The encouragement to act may motivate learners to take action on behalf of the local community (school environment) and the global community (the environment in general).

Table 8: The distribution of textbooks’ activities in the behavioral domain

Behavioral domain	TEFL	History	Civic education
Learners act effectively and responsibly at local, national, and global levels for a more peaceful and sustainable world.			<p>Role play (a clerk and student)</p> <p>Give examples of everyday behavior that contradicts civil behavior.</p> <p>Write a list of principles and values that regulate civil behavior.</p> <p>Case study: to clean your school environment</p> <p>Say which precautions a consumer should take before buying an expensive product (The National Organization</p>

			<p>for the Defense of Consumers)</p> <p>Discuss with a classmate the domains of civil society's activities in relation to the concept of global civil society.</p> <p>Complete the table with appropriate behavior that fosters civilized behaviors.</p> <p>Remember (cooperative behavior to work for the community.</p>
Learners develop motivation and willingness to take necessary actions	Write an article for your school magazine to show the benefits of the reasonable use of the internet		<p>Determine the relationship between voluntary participation, values of freedom, and willingness to take initiatives</p> <p>Complete the sentences (teach respect, encourage participation, volunteering (p. 132)</p>

4. Global Citizenship Education as a Cross-Curricular Approach in the Three Textbooks

This section aims to compare and relate between the findings of textbooks' analysis in order to find ways of collaboration and alignment between them so as to make global citizenship a cross-curricular competence.

4.1. Topics

According to UNESCO's (2015) classification of topics, issues relating the local to the global include democracy, historical events, and interculturality. These topics are found in history and civic education textbooks and are absent in the EFL textbook. The latter includes topics dealing with economic issues such as inflation, incomes, and economic changes, environmental issues such as pollution, and water scarcity, and human rights issues such as gender equality, child labor, slavery, and freedom. These topics are tackled as social problems and not as historical or legal ones. Democracy, which is a key issue in history and civic education textbooks, can be part of the EFL textbook's content.

The civic education textbook approaches topics from a legal perspective and uses legal topics such as democratic practices and institutions, and civil society's organizations and their role in society. Topics that are more related to real life should be added such as family, charity, school life, etc. As for the history textbook, a variety of topics are also related to macro-level events and subjects such as wars, colonization, political systems and institutions, slavery, social justice, and the development of human thought and human civilization. Other issues include ethnic groups and interculturality. TEFL textbooks and civic education can include such topics as interculturality and the relationship between past and present.

4.2. Activities

In terms of activities, the different subjects can also draw on one another with reference to UNESCO's learning domains on the basis of which the textbooks' content and activities are evaluated.

4.2.1. The Cognitive Domain

The findings of the cognitive domain show that the textbooks' activities mostly focus on the acquisition of knowledge and understanding of local, national, and global issues, rather than critical thinking skills. These activities include instructions addressing low-order thinking such as gap-filling, information transfer, and identifying figures from the text. As for critical thinking skills, activities including comparison, problem-solving, and decision-making are identified. In the history textbook, comparisons between present and past, and comparisons among phenomena in different countries are important for promoting critical thinking and establishing a connection between the local and the global. EFL and civic education textbooks can, therefore, include more activities inviting comparisons of global issues in different countries and cultures. EFL and history textbooks can use role plays and case studies mainly used in civic education textbooks. Case studies combine the use of different skills simultaneously such as analyzing, planning, seeking information from various sources, selecting relevant information, research methods, informed problem-solving and making informed decisions, comparing, and analyzing.

4.2.2. The Socio-Emotional Domain

The socio-emotional domain includes the development of a sense of belonging to common humanity and a sense of shared values and responsibilities based on human rights. The findings revealed that the civic education textbook presents more activities that foster a sense of belonging and sharing. Activities include discussions of universal values and those of the Arab Islamic cultural heritage (the learners' cultural background) as well as a case study where students have to solve a legal issue by referring to local and international laws and institutions. Unlike the EFL textbook's activities that are based on discussion and expression of attitudes, the history textbook focuses more on knowledge and understanding. The history and EFL textbooks may, therefore, use more case studies where they can discuss global issues and foster a sense of belonging to a wider community.

As far as the second component of the socio-emotional domain, that is attitudes of empathy and solidarity, the history textbook does

not address any of those attitudes. The EFL textbook asks learners to express worries and concerns about a particular global situation, whereas the civic education textbook invites thinking about and reflecting on how attitudes of respect and tolerance can foster democracy, human rights, and universal values of dialogue and tolerance and improve intercultural and international relationships. The history textbook can benefit from EFL and civic education textbooks' activities by enhancing students' sense of belonging to the world and expressing attitudes towards such topics as human rights, and ethnic groups which the textbook already includes as topics. Given its role as a means of global communication, English, similar to history, can be a means to discover other cultures. Therefore, discussing the effects of particular issues such as dialogue, interculturality, and diversity on their belonging to the world can be included as an activity in both the history (Brett, 2005) and English textbooks (Abid, 2021; Ait-Bouزيد, 2020).

4.2.3. The Behavioral Domain

The behavioral domain refers to the learners' ability to act effectively and responsibly at local, national, and global levels for a more peaceful and sustainable world. The behavioral domain is only addressed in the civic education textbook where activities comprise giving examples, listing principles of civil behaviors, case studies, voluntary work, and discussion of the relationship between civil society and the globalized society. It is possible for the other textbooks to use discussions and case studies to increase learners' willingness to take action in the local and global contexts.

Case studies are robust activities that combine the use of different skills simultaneously. They include thinking, planning, doing research, and taking real actions in society. Case studies can be relevant to teaching global citizenship through the EFL textbook as it presents topics on charity work and the environment. As for the history textbook, although it does not tackle everyday issues that are found in the learners' immediate environment, actions can be taken in history-related contexts such as visiting historical sites and making plans to protect them and guide people on how to visit them and benefit from the visit as suggested by Santisteban et al. (2018).

5. Discussion

This study investigated the extent to which civic education, history, and English language textbooks adopted a cross-curricular approach to teaching global citizenship. Content analysis was used to identify the degree of prominence of global topics and skills based on UNESCO's (2015) topics and learning objectives. The analysis covered the textbooks' content and activities in terms of their teaching of cognitive, socio-emotional, and behavioral skills. As the objective of the study is to promote global citizenship skills across the subjects of the curriculum, the findings were expected to provide insights into how global citizenship was taught across the subjects through textbooks' topics and activities. These insights can be useful for subjects teachers who can draw on other subjects' topics and teaching techniques to enrich their teaching practice and make it more effective.

The results have shown that, given the differing natures of the subjects in question, the topics are varied and presented from different perspectives: historical, legal, social, humanitarian, etc. For instance, the English language textbook's topics dealt with everyday life issues such as family life, entertainment, and school life, and gave less importance to global issues such as poverty, wars, immigration, and pollution. History and civic education textbooks presented macro-level issues from historical and legal perspectives respectively. While civic education textbooks tackle issues such as freedom, social injustice, human rights, and political power, history textbook presents historical events, their reasons, and their effects on the world. The national and global dimensions and their interconnectedness were more prominent in civic education and history textbooks where the relationship between national and international organizations and the effect of international historical events on national history were emphasized. In the European context, different findings were found by Engel's (2014) study on three textbooks associated with Spain's Education for Citizenship and Human Rights Curriculum. The study showed that although textbooks claimed to promote national and global citizenship values and appreciation of cultural diversity, they adopted a nationalist perspective regarding European and global citizenship and global interconnectivity.

As far as textbooks' activities are concerned, the analysis revealed that most textbooks' activities aimed to promote cognitive skills more than socio-emotional and behavioral ones. This implies that teaching these subjects is based mainly on the transmission of knowledge rather than on the promotion of attitudes of sympathy and solidarity and willingness to act for the benefit of the local, national, and international communities. The approach to teaching global citizenship is therefore knowledge-oriented rather than action-oriented. In teaching cognitive skills, textbooks' activities tended to enable students to know and understand the topic without going deeper to think critically about it. Critical thinking skills are underrepresented. The activities addressing the socio-emotional domain are infrequent in the history and English language textbooks, thus lowering their potential to foster learners' sense of belonging to their country and the world as well as their feelings of empathy and solidarity. The behavioral domain is the least addressed domain, which implies the textbooks' failure to enhance learners' willingness to participate and take action at local, national, and global levels. Abid's study (2021) on Tunisian EFL textbooks in terms of their development of intercultural/global citizenship revealed the inadequacy of their activities to teach global skills. The activities focused on teaching language structures and comprehension of written and audio texts, leaving no room for students to develop critical thinking skills and willingness to act or plan actions to solve the global issues they examined in class. Furthermore, Abid's study (2021) pointed out the limitations of EFL textbooks' representation of global issues and the world's cultural diversity. This underrepresentation, as argued by the researcher, may impede learners' acquisition of global skills, attitudes of sympathy and respect for difference, and willingness to take action at the local, national, and international levels.

The study argued for global citizenship education as a cross-curricular approach. The analysis of the textbooks yielded data that can feed their knowledge of teaching global citizenship and from which they can select a variety of topics and methods to improve the quality of their teaching of global citizenship skills and values. The suggestions that were made by the researcher on how teachers of the subjects in question can use topics and methods from other subjects were similar to suggestions made by Cates (2022). Cates

(2022) provided a model of global education as a cross-curricular approach. Like UNESCO's model (2015) of GCE, Cates' (2022) model is based on the development of knowledge (cognitive domain), attitudes (socio-emotional domain), and skills and actions (the behavioral domain). Those areas are addressed and developed by teaching content and skills across various subjects in the curriculum. Cates (2022) suggested three main topics drawing on school subjects such as geography, history, sciences, arts, literature, music, culture, etc. The activities also draw on different teaching methods and approaches and can be implemented in the different subjects of the curriculum. These activities include debates, discussions, surveys, interviews, projects, and case studies.

To conclude, the findings obtained from the analysis of three Tunisian school textbooks have provided evidence for the possibility of adopting GCE as a cross-curricular approach, an approach that was advocated by UNESCO's documents (2015, 2018) and rarely investigated by previous research.

Conclusion

The study reported in this paper aimed to investigate ways in which global citizenship education can be adopted as a cross-curricular teaching approach. To do this, content analysis was deployed to analyze the content and activities of three Tunisian school textbooks designed to teach history, civic education, and English. Based on UNESCO's (2015), global citizenship topics and learning objectives, the selected textbooks' content and activities were analyzed in terms of the topics and the cognitive, socio-emotional, and behavioral skills they teach. The objective was to find out how these textbooks address GCE topics and skills so that the findings obtained can be used by these subjects' teachers to enrich their knowledge and ways to improve their teaching of global citizenship and enhance its use across the curriculum. The results obtained from the analysis showed that, despite the claim of fostering values and skills of global citizenship, history, and civic education textbooks were content-based subjects whose teaching approach is knowledge-based and not skill-based. In line with these findings, the cognitive skills identified from the analysis were mostly the students' ability to acquire and understand knowledge and not the ability to think critically about global issues. Despite

the imbalance in the representation of skills and knowledge, the three textbooks displayed a variety of topics ranging from everyday life to acro-level historical events and issues related to social injustice, human rights, and the exercise of political power.

The skills are also varied; despite being limited in number. Teaching activities such as project work, case studies, discussion, and debates figured as good activities for teaching global citizenship skills and values. These include the use of critical thinking skills enabling learners to understand the interconnectedness of local, national, and global issues and use that understanding in solving local and global issues. The findings obtained might help raise teachers' awareness of other ways of approaching GCE and inform them of possible content and methods to be used in their classes which can improve the quality of teaching global citizenship.

This piece of research attempted to explore how subjects other than English are actually teaching global citizenship, as claimed by their official programs. As an English teacher, these findings gave an idea about other types of content and teaching methods that might be effective in teaching global citizenship in English language classes. Although this study offered insights into the different ways in which GCE can be taught across the Tunisian curriculum, it has many limitations. With reference to the review of the literature, different subjects, including social studies and scientific ones, can implement a global citizenship approach to their teaching, which implies the possibility of implementing it as a cross-curricular approach. A larger scale study can be conducted on other subjects of different contents to identify their potential for teaching GCE. Those subjects may include physical education, music, biology, natural sciences, physics, chemistry, and arts. Given the richness of those subjects and their uniqueness of contents, their analysis in terms of their promotion of GCE may yield significant results for teachers and curriculum designers who intend to include GCE as a cross-curricula approach.

References

- Abid, N. (2021). Teaching global issues for intercultural citizenship in a Tunisia EFL textbook: Skills for life. In M. Victoria & Ch. Sangiamchit (Ed.), *Interculturality and the English language classroom* (pp. 119-145). Palgrave Macmillan.
- Ait-Bouزيد, H. (2020). Exploring global citizenship as a cross-curricular theme in Moroccan ELT textbooks. *Eurasian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 6(2): 229-242.
- Brett, P. (2005). Citizenship through history - What is good practice? *International Journal of Historical Learning, Teaching, and Research*, 5(2):10-27.
- Cates, K. A. (2022). Global education as a cross-curricular approach to language teaching for democracy. *Iranian Journal of Language Teaching Research*, 10(3): 75-96.
- Engel, L. C. (2014). Global citizenship and national (re)formulations: Analysis of citizenship education reform in Spain. *Education, Citizenship, and Social Justice*, 9(3): 239-254.
- Esteves, M. H. (2012). Geography education and citizenship education in Portugal: A challenge for the 21st century. *Sage Open*, 2(4). doi: 10.1177/2158244012471956
- Geiger, V. Gal, I., & Graven, M. (2023). The connections between citizenship education and mathematics education. *ZDM-Mathematics Education*, 55: 923-940. doi: 10.1007/s11858-023-01521-3
- Idrissi, H. (2020). Exploring global citizenship learning and ecological behavior change through extra-curricular activities. *International Journal of Life Long Education*, 39(2): 1-19.
- Idrissi H., & Benabderrazik, Y. (2020). (Re)imagining the responsible, national citizen: Analysis of Moroccan citizenship education textbooks. *Transnational Curriculum Inquiry*, 17(1): 31-48.
<http://nitinat.library.ubc.ca/ojs/index.php/tci>

- Ministry of Education. (2008). History and Geography Programmes for Secondary Education. Republic of Tunisia.
- Ministry of Education. (2008). English Programmes for Secondary Education. Years, 1, 2, 3, 4. (2008). Republic of Tunisia.
- Ministry of Education. (2008). Civic Education Programmes for Secondary Education. Republic of Tunisia.
- Oxfam Education. (2015). Maths and Global citizenship. Why teach Maths with a global citizenship approach? <https://policy-practice.oxfam.org/resources/maths-and-global-citizenship-a-guide-to-help-teach-maths-with-a-global-citizens-620650/>
- Pike. G., & Selby, D. (1988). *Global teacher, global learner*. Hodder and Stoughton.
- Sahli, N., & Belaid, L. (2022). The incarnation of global citizenship education in an Algerian secondary foreign language education textbook. *Global Journal of Foreign Language Teaching*, 12(1): 01-10. doi: 10.18844/gjflt.v12i1.648
- Santisteban, A., Pagès, J., & Bravo, L. (2018). History education and global citizenship education. In I. Davies, L. C. Ho, D. Kiwan, C. L. Peck, A. Peterson, E. Sant, & Y. Waghid (Ed.), *The Palgrave Handbook of Global Citizenship and Education* (pp. 457-472). Palgrave Macmillan.
- Tudball, L., & Henderson, D. (2014). Contested notions of civics and citizenship education as national education in the Australian Curriculum. *Curriculum and Teaching*, 29(2): 5-24. doi: 10.7459/ct/29.2.02
- UNESCO. (2015). Global Citizenship Education. Topics and Learning Objectives.
- UNESCO. (2018). Global Citizenship Education. <https://en.unesco.org/themes/gced>.